SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Madam, how long will it take?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI SARLA MAHESHWARI): Only two speakers are left. So don't worry. We will be able to finish it.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Then, let the discussion be over.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Whenever the House agrees, I will do it. You fix the day. I have no problem.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam,...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी) :नारायणस्वामी जी,अगर आप बैठे तो मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से सदन की अनुमति से यह निवेदन कर सकती हूं कि वो चाहे तो अपने बयान को सदन के पटल पर रख दें।

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, I do not know what the Minister is going to speak. We are not privy to it. This is a highly controversial issue. I would prefer that the Minister reads the statement.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I have no problem. I can read it.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी) :अगर आप इच्छुक है तो ...(**व्यवधान**).. आप पहले पढ़ दीजिए। बाद मे हम लोग ...।

STATEMENT BY MINISTER

Affidavits filed on Behalf of Union of India in the Writ Petition (C) 270 of 2004 filed By K.G. Dhananjay Chauhan Versus Union of India and Others

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Madam, in the last few days, various statements have been carried in the media in respect of the affidavits filed on behalf of the Union of India (UO) in the Writ Petition (C) 270 of 2004 filed by K.G. Dhananjay Chauhan *versus* Union of India and others. I would like to place the facts on record.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair)

The Writ Petition had been filed in the Supreme Court on 15th June, 2004 as a Public Interest Litigation. The Writ Petition is primarily based on the report of the Comptroller and Auditor General (CAG) No. 7A of 2001 which deals with the special audit of cases of procurement done for

'Operation Vijay' (Kargil). The CAG examined 123 cases of procurement of defence equipment and has pointed out deficiencies in 35 cases. It has concluded that 'the excuse of Kargil was cited to push through procurements that would otherwise have been scrutinised more closely'.

The Petitioner has, *inter alia,* prayed that an appropriate writ may be issued to conduct an inquiry and fix responsibility for procurements made for'Operation Vijay.

When the case came up for hearing in the Supreme Court on 25th October, 2004, the hon. Court directed the Union of India (UOI) 'to file an affidavit by way of response showing the details of the action, if any, taken on the report of the CAG Public Accounts Committee (PAC) 54th Report and report of Central Vigilance Commission (CV"C), referred to in paragraph 5.11 of the 54th Report of the PAC

Pursuant to the directions of the hon. Supreme Court dated 25th October, 04, the Ministry of Defence (MoD) had forwarded a brief to the learned Attorney General on 26th November, 04, explaining the action taken by the Government on the CAG & CVC reports. Adraft affidavit was received from the learned Attorney General on 2nd December, 04. On 28th December, 04, a modified draft, consistent with the orders of the Supreme Court dated 25th October, 04 and highlighting the details of the action taken was forwarded to the learned Attorney General for taking further necessary acton. On 21 st February, 05 the learned Attorney General discussed this modified draft with officers of the MoD and suggested amendments which were incorporated and sent back on 9th March, 05.

This affidavit was filed on behalf of the UOI on 10th March, 2005 in the hon. Supreme Court. The affidavit is in two parts.

The first part deals with procedures. The affidavit clarified that the modified procedure dated 21st June, 1999 was meant to shorten the time frame particularly for imports of item specifically require for 'Op Vijay'. This modified procedure was issued without relaxing the requirements of the Defence Procurement Procedure, 1992. This is also reflected in the comments of the CAG However, this part of the affidavit did not comment on whether this procedure was correctly followed while affecting procurement.

The second part of the affidavit deals with the action taken by the

Government on the CAG and CVC report and the status of the PAC Report. The affidavit points out:

a. The Government has continued to make efforts to address issues raised in the CAG Report. Eleven out of 35 paras contained in the CAG Report have been vetted by the CAG and the remaining are at various stages of examination.

b. After expiry of the term of the Tehelka Commission, the transactions, two of which (Hand Held Thermal Imager and Terminally Guided Munition (Krasnopol) formed part of the CAG Report also, stand referred to the Central Bureau of Investigation, CBI.

c. The observations made by the CVC regarding involvement of middlemen and the need for making procurement procedures more transparent are being addressed by the Government.

d. In so far as the individual cases examined by the CVC are concerned, in three cases, administrative action has been taken against the guilty officials, 12 cases have been closed by the CVC and 21 cases are still under examination in the Ministry or under correspondence with the CVC.

e. Three cases referred in the CVC Report which also find mention in the Tehelka tapes (T-90S tanks, Armored Recovery Vehicle and up-gunning of 130 mm M-46 Field Gun to 155 mm calibre) now stand referred to the CBI.

During the hearing of the Writ Petition on 14th March, 2005 the hon. Supreme Court ordered 'the Learned Amicus Curiae points out that the counter affidavit filed seems to be evasive and not complete in all respects. The Learned Attorney General assures to look into the matter and file an additional affidavit, if required.'

On 5th April, 05 a press conference was held by a political leader claiming that a 'clean chit had been given to him in the affidavit filed on behalf of the Union of India in the Supreme Court. On 5th April, 05 the Learned Attorney General communicated the order of the hon. Supreme Court dated 14th March, 05 along with a copy of the same. On 6th April, 05 the Learned Attorney General sent another letter enclosing a copy of the draft additional affidavit to be filed in the hon. Supreme Court. Both these letters were received on 6th April, 05 in the Ministry of Defence.

In compliance of the Supreme Court order dated 14th March, 05 the additional affidavit was filed on behalf of the Union of India on 13th April, 2005. This stressed on the future course of action to be taken on the CAG Report. The affidavit points out that five cases of procurement were again scrutinised in details with a view to fix the responsibility.

The affidavit also states that since the CAG Reports has brought out that the 'excuse of Kargil was cited to push through procurements that would otherwise have been scrutinised more closely', thereby, suggesting serious misconduct on the part of officials/authorities in the Government, including the then Defence Minister, the Government has decided to refer 23 cases included in the CAG Report to the CBI for investigation.

On 13th April, 05 the Department of Personnel and Training has been informed of the decision of the Government to hand over the aforesaid cases to the CBI.

An impression has been sought to be created that some kind of a 'clean chit has been given to certain individuals and that there is a 'IT turn between the first and the second affidavits. A reading of the affidavits makes it amply clear that no 'clean chit' was given to anyone in the first affidavit filed by the Union of India on 10th March, 05 nor has there been any 'U' turn between the first and the second affidavits. While the first affidavit explains the procedure of procurement and details of the action taken by the Government, the second affidavit charts out the future course of action contemplated by the Government.

I would like to assure the hon. Members that the Government is committed to take strict action against officers/authorities, including the former Defence Minister, if it is found that the excuse of Kargil was taken to make purchases with the motive of personal benefit in violation of rules and regulations. Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It was decided that the hon. Minister will lay the statement, and clarifications would be taken up later, and discussion on the Water Resources Ministry should continue. Since it takes time for clarifications, that was the agreement.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA(Jharkhand): Sir, there are ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have every right to seek clarifications.

We are not saying that you should not seek. A time will be fixed and then you can have your own points.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, it make's a world difference. The hon. Defence Minister has made a statement in this House now. What will be reported in the media is that the hon. Minister has made the statement and our case will go completely unrepresented. This is a situation which is not acceptable. *(Interruptions)* I am a Member of this House and I would like to seek clarifications.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Even when the hon. Prime Minister made the statment, it was agreed that the matter would be taken up.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, the Prime Minister's statement is completely in a different genre. This is a highly controversial statement the hon. Raksha Mantri has made. He can't get away with this. I have just seen the Statement *...(Interruptions)* This is a complete travesty of the truth the hon. Defence Minister has made. *...(Interruptions)...* He is misleading the House and you want the House to keep quiet? When the hon. Raksha Mantri *...(Interruptions)...*

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is a convention of this House; it.will be discussed. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Jharkhand): How can he mislead the House, Sir?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is your opinion. *...(Interruptions)...* This has been taken up in between the discussion, to facilitate. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No, Sir, the Raksha Mantri is completely wrong on facts. Cant I not seek clarifications?

DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Definitely you can. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE (West Bengal): I want to seek clarifications. We want to seek clarifications. But do you want to have clarifications right now? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Sir, why now? *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, please sit down.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA; Sir, this is a complete travesty of truth. This is what t am saying with full sense of responsibility. The Raksha Mantri's Statement is...

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have the right to seek clarification. Ministers are making statements on the Floor of the House. Sometimes, because of certain things, we agree to take up clarifications later on, because it require time. According to you, this is an important statement and you want to seek clarifications. Not only you, the entire House has the right to seek clarifications.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, it is a controversial statement.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is your point of view that it is a controversial statement. Now, the question is about the time. We would take a decision and we would fix a time and then it can be discussed. We work in consensus. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, with the greatest respect to you I say, the Leader of the Opposition had made a statement in the morning in this House where he demanded that certain documents with regard to these defence deals to be laid on the Table of the House. On that, the Chairman has already given a ruling. We reserve our right to have the fullest, most comprehensive discussion, in this House, on defence purchases after those documents, namely, Phukan Commission Report and the CVC Report have been laid on the Table of the House.

Thai is another issue. *...(Interruptions)...* That is another issue. I am not going into that at all. The point I am making, Sir, is that a Statement has been made. I did not know what the hon. Raksha Mantri is going to say. But when I have heard him while reading this Statement, then I said that despite the agreement or understanding that might have been reached with regard to clarification, this is Statement which cannot go unchallenged for one second in this House. This is point *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We can take it up. *...(Interruptions)...* We can fix a time and take it up. *...(Interruptions)...* Even we can take it up tomorrow, if agreed. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: It is the convention of the House. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Is it not a fact mr. Ahluwalia *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE (West Bengal): We also want to seek clarifications. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Whenever a Statement is made in this House, clarifications are sought on that... *(Interruptions).,.*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would like to know whether we did not agree that *...(Interruptions)...* Mr. Narayanasamy, did we not agree that the Defence Minister is going to make a Statement ? *...(Interruptions).:.* It was listed that the hon. Defence Minister is going to make a Statement and the Members were also informed that a Statement will be made. But it required a lot of time because the entire House wanted to seek clarifications on it, therefore, it was discussed and you agreed, Is it not a fact that you agreed that clarifications will be taken up later? It was agreed that the Defence Minister will lay the Statement and we will have clarifications at a later date? That was the agreement. That is why in the middle of the discussion on the Water Resources Ministry which is still not completed with two more Members yet to speak, and then the Minister to reply, the Chair permitted the hon. Defence Minsiter to lay the Statement. Otherwise, it would have been after the completion of the discussion *....(Interruptions)...*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: He has read *....(Interruptions)...]* insisted that he should read the Statement and the hon. the Raksha Mantri has read the Statement.... *(Interruptions)..* .It has not been laid on the Table of the House.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We requested the Secretariat that we want to seek clarifications on this. That is the reason why we asked him to read his Statement *....(Interruptions)...* Otherwise, he could have laid the Statement *....(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, you are a senior member. You should help the Chair *....(Interruptions)...*

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Sir, what is this? *....(Interruptions)...They are* always doing like this *....(Interruptions)...*There

is a limit to everything *....(Interruptions)...* They cannot dictate like this. .... *(Interruptions).* ..We want a full-fledged discussion on this. .... *(Interruptions).* ..What is this 'clean chit? *....(Interruptions)...They* have done many things *....(Interruptions)*...They want to hide many thing. *....(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It has already been agreed that if other Memebrs.... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, we requested the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. *....(Interruptions)...*

MR DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are breaking the conventions .... *(Interruptions)...In* this way, it is ver difficult for the Chair to function. We agreed on certain thing. If we go back, it will be difficult for the Chair to take a decision *....(Interruptions)...\Ne* agreed on certain thing. And if we go back, it will be very difficult for the Chair. *....(Interruptions)...*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Did we know what the hon. Raksha mantri was going to say?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Pardon *....(Interruptions)...*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: When this decision was taken, by whatever body, that no clarifications will be sought to day and that it will be postponed for a later date.... *(Interruptions).* ..Did we know? *....(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, please let me listen to him *....(Interruptions)...Let* me understand what he is saying. ....(Interruptions)...Please sit down *...(Interruptions)...]* will listen to your point also *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I entirely agree. I have also been informed by the Leaders of my party who attended the meeting that it was decided that we will seek clarifications later. They even suggested that may be the hon. Raksha Mantri need not read the Statement, he could lay it on the Table of the House. The simple point that I am making with all the sense of responsibility that I have is that nobody could anticipate what the hon. Raksha Mantri was going to say.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. Even the Chair cannot anticipate.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Even the Chair cannot anticipate. Now, Sir,

when the hon. Raksha Mantri said that he should read the Statement, he read the Statement. We know what the Statement says and we feel that it has raised some very grave issues which need to be debated here and now. This is the point I am making.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Time is the constraint ..... *(Interruption)...*I leave it to the sense of the House because it is *....(Interruptions)...*

प्रो.राम देव भंडारी(बिहार)**:** इनकी फीजिंग से हाउस नहीं चलेगा । **…**(**व्यवधान**) ये जो फील करते है उससे हाउस नहीं चलेगा। **…**(**व्यवधान**)**…**

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: No, it is the convention of the House *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, what is convention ? I am talking about convention. I am only talking about convention. I fully agree with you. We have to go by conventions. The convention of this House, if there is paucity of time, somethimes the Members themselves say in the meeting that we would take up the clarifications. It happened in the morning. It happens every day. From your point of view, you may say that you have to raise it. Every member wants to participate in it. There should be a discussion. Other Members also want to seek clarifications. If all agree then *....(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: By this time *....(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, that is not the point.

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: When he says clarifications and debate on this issue is necessary, there is absolutely no point of disagreement. They only thing is, the word he used was "right now" It is not for him to decide. The House has to decide.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: No, no, you are wrong..... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I cannot even make a request! *....(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Narayanasamy, what is your point?

SHRI V. NARAYANSAMY: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, it is very unconventional to mention anything which we discuss in the Business Advisory Committee. *...(Interruptions)*

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : मंत्री जी से पूछिए कि वे जवाब देना चाहते है या नहीं देना चाहते है। मंत्री जी एक्सपीरिएंस्ड मिनिस्टर है, इस सदन में रहे है, सबसे ज्यादा उनको एक्सपीरिएंस है। उनके द्वारा दिउ गए स्टेटमेंट पर कुछ क्लेरिफिकेशंस विपक्ष पूछना चाहता है, ताकि वे जवाब देना चाहते है या नहीं, बस यही सीधी बात है, मंत्री जी से पूछिए।

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I could not get your point.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: My point is, you are the most experienced person as far as Rajya Saha is concerned. After your Statement was read out, the entire Opposition is agitated on that. They want certain clarifications from you. Are you ready to respond to that or not? Are you ready to respond to that or not? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Don't say' entire house'. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: It is a simple issue. On behalf of the Opposition we want a clarifiaction. Do you want to respond to it or not?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I would like to clarify one point. Mr. Yashwant Sinha in his excitement used certain phrases which he should not have used, that I am getting away. I am not prepared to get away. On the very first day.....

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: No, you said, "you cannot run away, you cannot get away with this Statement." I am not getting away. I want a full-fledged discussion on this Statement. The second point is, it is not correct to say like that. If you kindly go through the records it was said that 'you made that Statement in the other House; as a result of that it has gone to the media, therefore, just to play innocent that we did not know... *(Interruptions).* ..we did not know' *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will look into it. *...(Interruptions)...* I will look into it. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I am at the disposal of the House.

Whatever the House will direct me, I will accept it *...(Interruptions)...*

I am at the disposal of the House. Whatever the House wants me to do, I will do that *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will look into the record ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I have certainly said that he read a statement in this House. This is the only thing which goes on record. The contrary view does not go on record. And this situation is not acceptable to us. We feel that the contrary views should also go on record. Who is going to put those contrary views? It is we, the Members of the Opposition here. We will put forth the contrary view, nor they ...*(Interruptions)*...Not Mr. Narayanasamy.. .*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There are others who also want to seek clarifications ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Not even our friends ...*(Interruptions)*...Mr. Ahluwalia has put a question to the Hon. Defence Minister. And that question is: Is the Defence Minister prepared to take up clarification? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Sir, this is not fair ...(Interruptions)...This statement is not the property of the Opposition or the property of the Ruling Benches. It is the property of the House. Clarifications are sought by the House. I am very sorry to say that in the heat of the moment, Mr. Yashwant Sinha said that the Opposition would seek clarifications ...*(Interruptions)*... The clarifications cannot be sought only by the Opposition. The entire House would like to seek clarifications ...*(Interruptions)*...The statement is the property of the House. The House wants to seek clarifications on the statement. We all want to see that detailed debate takes place. But, the point is: Should the debate take place now or afterwards? And it is not the Minister or Mr. Sinha who has to decide it. It is the House which has to decide when the debate has to take place ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You said that you want to seek clarifications. Every Member of the House has a right to seek clarifications on the statement. The clarifications are not confined to the Opposition along. So, when you are given an opportunity to seek clarifications, other Members should also have a right to seek clarification...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Yes, Sir. by all means ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But the problem is ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, I have a small submission to make *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, please bear with me *...(Interruptions)...* We have not concluded the discussion on the functioning of the Ministry of Water Resources. It is only to facilitate the Minister we have allowed him to make the statement. You know pretty well that it is not correct to take up some other subject while discussion on a particular subject is going on. There are two more Members to speak on the functioning of the Ministry of Water Resources. The debate on this is not yet concluded. You all should cooperate with the Chair and set good conventions. If you start seeking clarifications, you know how much time will it take. Then, you will not be able to decide when clarifications would be over and when the debate would start again. So, first, let the debate continue. If there is time, we will take up clarifications.. *.(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, I have a small submission *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, let the debate be continued *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, please allow me to make a point *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then, I will look into the possibility *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, I have a small submission *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI EKANATH K. THAKUR (Maharashtra): Sir, my view is *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is your view. I need not consider your view alone *...(Interruptions)...* Ultimately, I will take the sense of the House ... *(Interruptions).* ..I will convince *you...(Interruptions)...* I have identified Mr. Narayanasamy because when Mr. Yashwant Sinha was speaking, I told him that I would give him an opportunity to put forth his view-point *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: In the meeting...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't refer to the contents of the. meeting on the floor of the House. You say what you wanted to say on this point.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: That is the crucial point here. It was decided and agreed by the leaders that we would have a full-fledged discussion on the subject by fixing a date. Thereafter, the hon. senior leaders from the Opposition party, after the hon. Defence Minister making a statement, wanted to seek clarifications! So, my point is, whether this is a breach of agreement or not *...(Interruptions)...* Let me get the reply *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have already stated this ... *(Interruptions).* ..Why are you repeating this again? I have already said as to what happened and what agreement has been arrived at. You need not repeat it again. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: How can Mr. Yashwant Sinha say that he wanted to seek clarification right now?... *(Interruptions)..* .It has been decided in the presence of all leaders *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, I have already ruled that*...(Interruptions)...* I have already said that the permission was taken to lay the statement. But, in the meantime, the statement was read. Now, the debate should conclude. Later on we can seek clarifications on the statement *...(Interruptions)..A* will take the sense of the House. *...(Interruptions)...Lei* the debate be concluded. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI C. RAMACHANDRAIAH (Andhra Pradesh): Let there be clarifications. Let there be a discussion. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ramachandraiah, the House cannot go on changing the convention depending upon the *...(Interruptions)...* we cannot go on changing the convention. *...(Intenvptions)...*

श्री मूल चन्द मीणा (**राजस्थान**) **:**आपकी व्यवस्था का क्या हुआ आपने व्यवस्था दी है **…**(**व्यवधान**)**…**

PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ (Jammu and Kashmir): Sir, you take the sense of the House. *(Interruptions)*

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया :सर, कल दोनों सदनों की कार्यवाही इसी मुद्दे को लेकर नहीं चल सकी और यही कारण था, यही मांग विपक्ष की थी कि जो दूसरा ऐफीडैविट फाइल हुआ है, उसको विद्रड्रॉ किया जाए। **…**(**व्यवधान**)**…**

श्री ए.विजय राघवन (**आन्ध्र प्रदेश**) :सर, यह क्या हो रहा है? Is this clarification? *(Interruptions)*

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया :मेरी बात सुन लीजिए। आप कह रहे है कि यह क्यों है, क्या आप मुझे बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि क्या सुप्रीम कोर्ट में **...(व्यवधान)...** मैं आ रहा हूं। भारत सरकार जब भी कोई ऐफीडैविट फाइल करती है तो क्या **...(व्यवधान)....**

श्री उपसभापति : यह मेरी जिम्मेदारी नहीं है। आप बैठिए। **...(व्यवधान)..**

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: This is very important. This was the demand of the Opposition. *(Interruptions)* The *Raksha Mantri* has come to the House with a Statement. *(Interruptions)* And, second thing, Sir, दूसरा, लिस्ट ऑफ बिजिनेस में लिखा है कि " सभा दिन के लिए उठने से पहले दिया जाएगा"। इसका मतलब क्या है?

श्री उपसभापति :बोलिए, क्या है?

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया :आपने बीच में दिया-सभा दिन के लिए उठने के पहले, ऐडर्जन करने के पहले देना था-आपने दिया। आपने तो सब कुछ चेंज किया। यह विपक्ष की मांग थी और विपक्ष क्लैरीफिकेशन पूछना चाहता है। मंत्री महोदय से जो सवाल मैंने किया कि मंत्री महोदय से जो सवाल मैंने किया कि मंत्री महोदय विपक्ष के सवाल का जवाब देना चाहते है या नहीं चाहते, उसका जवाब नहीं आया। **...(व्यवधान)..**

श्री उपसभापति : आप बोलिए, आप क्या बोलते है। **...(व्यवधान)...**जोशी साहब बोलेंगे। **...(व्यवधान)...** नारायणसामी जी. बैठिए। **...(व्यवधान)..** आकाश हरगिज़ नहीं गिरेगा। आप बैठिए। **...(व्यवधान)..** That is not the Question.

SHRI SHARAD ANANTRAO JOSHI (Maharashtra): Sir, you have recognized me to seek clarification. Whatever the agreement was, when we did not know what was going to be the tenor and the content of the statement was going to be *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I do not agree with you. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD ANANTRAO JOSHI: I was not a party to that agreement. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not necessary. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHARAD ANANTRAO JOSHI: I feel that the House cannot certainly sleep on it *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I respect your feeling. *(Interruptions)* I respect your feeling, but... *(Interruptions)* I have already said that if the clarifications are to be sought, then, I will take the sense of the House after concluding this debate. *(Interruptions)*

PROF. RAM DEO BHANDARY: This is a new problem, Sir. *(Interruptions)*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (**उत्तरांचल**) :सर, रक्षा मंत्री तैयार है। उन्होंने कहा है कि वे जो क्लैरीफिकेशंस है ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति :श्री मनोज भट्टाचार्य। ...(**व्यवधान**).. श्री नारायणसामी। ...(**व्यवधान**)..एक मिनट। you should help the chair.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :मैं हैल्प करने के लिए ही कह रही हूं। जिस समय, जो बात आपने कहीं कि अंदर जो ऐग्रीमेंट हुआ था कि ले कर देंगे और बाद में क्लैरिफिकेशंन होंगे लेकिन बाद में जब यशंवत सिन्हा जी ने यह कहा कि यह स्टेटमेंट अनचैलेंज्ड नहीं जाना चाहिए और मुझे इसमें पूछना है तो संसदीय कार्यमंत्री को हमने विश्वास में लिया और उनसे कहा कि बजाय ले करने के वे स्टेटमैंट पढ़े और यशंवत सिन्हा जी सवाल पूछना चाहते है। तब उन्होंने कहा कि कोई समस्या नहीं है। इसलिए अभी अहलुवालिया जी ने फिर पूछा ...(**व्यवधान**).. और रक्षा मंत्री जी ने यह कहा कि अगर चेयर कहे तो मैं तैयार हूं। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति : अब वे नहीं है। आप अपनी प्रॉब्लम में चेयर को क्यों निशाना बनाते हो? ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मेरा कहने का मतलब यह है कि अभी जब यह पूछा गया तो रक्षा मंत्री जी ने भी कहा कि अगर चेयर कहे तो मैं जवाब देने के लिए तैयार हूं। सर, इतनी देर में तो एक सवाल पूछ लिया जाएगा। सर, सवाल पूछ लेने दीजिए, जवाब आ जाए ....(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति : चेयर के ऊपर जिम्मेदारी मत डालिए।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : चेयर के ऊपर नहीं डाल रहे है।

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया :चेयर के विपक्ष के लिए है। ...(**व्यवधान**)... चेयर तो विपक्ष की रक्षा के लिए है।

श्री उपसभापति : हाउस की रक्षा के लिए है।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : सर, मैं चेयर पर नहीं डाल रही। मैं तो यह कह रही हूं कि The Defence Minister is gracious enough to respond.

वे कह रहे है कि मैं तैयार हूं। मैं उनके ग्रेस का फायदा उठाकर कह रही हूं। he is gracious enough to say, 'yes' तो इतनी देर में तो सवाल पूछने दीजिए। ..(**व्यवधान**).. वे तैयार है। ..(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति : आपने प्रोटेस्ट लॉन्च किया। आपने कहा कि आपको यह acceptable नहीं है। इससे तो एक मैसेज जाएगा। ...(**व्यवधान**).. इसको कल ले लेंगे। Tomorrow we will take up clarifications. यह आज हो जाने दीजिए। ...(**व्यवधान**).. यह सही परंपरा नहीं है। मेरी विनती है कि यह सही नहीं है, वरना देखिए, With all humility, I would like to say that if you are going to do like this, then, we cannot conduct the House. After all, we run the House with consensus. We take everybody into confidence. Sometimes, the views of the opposition parties are accommodated, and sometimes the views of the ruling party are accommodated. यह कह देना कि "We don't agree with it. Now, we change" this way, you will be embarrassing the Chair. Under such circumstances, what decision the Chair can take? यह बात सही नहीं है। ..(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is this, Sir? *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री उपसभापति :अहलुवालिया जी, आप चाहे जितना भी गुस्से से बोलिए मैं गुस्से मे आने वाला नहीं हूं। ... मैं गुस्से में आने वाला नहीं हूं, आप जितना भी बोलिए, मगर सवाल यह है कि ...(**व्यवधान**)..

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :सर, हमने सरकार को बताया कि इस-इस तरह से हम सवाल पूछना चाहते है। उन्होंने कहा कि नो प्रॉब्लम, आप पूछ लीजिए। फिर सेक्रेटेरिएट को बताया कि सवालों को पुछवाइए और रक्षा मंत्री भी तैयार है, इसलिए मैं आपसे कहना चाहती हूं कि ...(**व्यवधान**)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will take up this issue. What I have ruled is, I will take up this issue. It is my responsibility that this debate should be completed today. This debate should be over today. Please help the Chair in completing the debate. There are only two speakers. यही सही होगा ...(**व्यवधान**)..

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :सर, मिनिस्टर का रिप्लाई कल होगा, डिबेट आज खत्म नहीं हो रही है।

श्री उपसभापति :नहीं, रिप्लाई कल होगा, लेकिन डिबेट आज कंप्लीट होनी चाहिए।

these two Members withdraw. I will say that the debate is completed. I cannot leave the debate unfinished.

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA (West Bengal): Sir, am I allowed to speak now? *(Interruptions)...* Sir, am I allowed to speak now?

श्री उपसभापति :बोलिए, मनोज भट्टाचार्य जी।

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, I am on my legs to comment on the functioning of the Ministry of Water Resources...*(Interruptions)...*

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी :सर, वे पानी पर बोलने के लिए तैयार है । He is talking of clean water. You are talking about clean chit. Let us have some clean water.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :सर, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। मेरा एक प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point of *order ...(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :सर, मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर यह है कि रिवाइज्ड लिस्ट ऑफ बिजनेस में **...(व्यवधान)..** सर, मेरा प्वांइट ऑफ ऑर्डर यह है कि अगर हमें बिल्कुल नियम और कानून से चलना है तो आज के रिवाइज्ड लिस्ट ऑफ बिजनेस में जो मिनिस्टर का स्टेटमेंट था, वह लिस्टेड था asterisk mark के साथ और asterisk mark के आगे लिखा था इसका मतलब था कि आप वाटर रिर्सोसेज की यह डिबेट पूरी करवा लेते, उसके बाद इनको बुलवाते। लेकिन ऐसा नहीं हुआ, आपने बीच में व्यवधान करके उनको बुलवाया और अगर आपने बीच में व्यवधान करके बुलवाया तो **...(व्यवधान)...** आपने बीच में व्यवधान करके बुलवाया और यही तय हुआ है कि मिनिस्टर रिप्लाई कल देंगे, इसलिए आज यह बहस खत्म नहीं होगी। तो ये जो दो मैम्बरान बोलने वाले है, दोनों ऑनरेबल मैम्बर्स कल मिनिस्टर के रिप्लाई से पहले बोल सकते है। हमारी प्रॉब्लम यह है कि **...(व्यवधान)..**

श्री उपसभापति :इसलिए बीच में बुलवाया, मैं बताता हूं। **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : जो बात हमने अंदर मानी थी कि मिनिस्टर स्टेटमेंट ले कर दें और ले करने के बाद क्लेरिफिकेशन बाद में हो जाएं, तो जब मिनिस्टर का स्टेटमेंट हमने देखा तो यह लगा कि उसमें कुछ ऐसे मुद्दे है, जो अनआन्सर्ड नहीं जाने चाहिए। उनका आन्सर आज आना जरूरी है और इसलिए बहुत साफ शब्दों में यशवंत जी ने कहा कि उनका पक्ष छपेगा और हमारा पक्ष नहीं छपेगा, यह हमारे साथ अन्याय होगा। इसलिए हम जो अंदर बात तय करके आए थे, उसे अपने आप नहीं बदला।

सरकार ने बोल दिया, संसदीय कार्य मंत्री ने **...(व्यवधान)..**

श्री उपसभापति :देखिए, क्या मिनिस्टर का स्टेटमेंट **...(व्यवधान)...** जो हमारा एग्रीमेंट होता है, क्या वह मिनिस्टर की स्टेटमेंट के ऊपर डिपेंड होता है? नहीं **...(व्यवधान)..** जो भी स्टेटमेंट मिनिस्टर देंगे, वह देंगे। उसके ऊपर तो डिपेंड नहीं होता है। **...(व्यवधान)..**

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, for how long should I stand like this? *...(Interruptions)...* I am on my legs. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री एस.एस अहलुवालिया : हमारी भावनाओं पर **...(व्यवधान)..**

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :सर, मिनिस्टर के स्टेटमेंट, स्टेटमेंट में फर्क होता है **..(व्यवधान)...**

श्री उपसभापति :मैं करूंगा, मैं करूंगा। आप बैठिए, प्लीज। **...(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, I want to continue. *...(Interruptions)...* Sir, I want to continue. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : सर, मिनिस्टर के स्टेटमेंट, स्टेटमेंट में फर्क होता है।एक होता है सुओमोटो स्टेटमेंट **...(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: How is she qualifying this? How is she qualifying a Statement? *...(Interruptions)...* What is this? *...(Interruptions)...* Sir, this is too much. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, Mr. Jairam Ramesh wants to say something. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes; Mr. Jairam Ramesh, what do you want to say? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I want to say one thing *...(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :उसमें जो कुछ मंत्री जी कहते है **...(व्यवधान)..** उस पर क्लेरिफिकेशन होता है। हमने यह मांगा था। यह विवादास्पद स्टेटमेंट है,**...(व्यवधान)..**

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, I want to continue. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : सर, मिनिस्टर के स्टेटमेंट, स्टेटमेंट में फर्क होता है **..(व्यवधान)..**

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, what is this? *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री उपसभापति :पहले इन दोनों को कम्पलीट करने दीजिए। The Chair has to take some decision. *...(Interruptions)...* The Chair cannot function under pressure. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : वे बोलेंगे **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री उपसभापति : वह बोलेंगे **...(व्यवधान)...** आज हमारा यह है कि आज डिबेट कनक्लूड होनी चाहिए। Yes; Mr. Manoj Bhattacharya *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir I am stating...*(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :सर, ये दोनों कल बोल लेंगे **...(व्यवधान)...** कल दे देंगे। **...(व्यवधान)..**

श्री उपसभापति :नहीं-नहीं, मैं वह सब कैसे दे सकता हूं। **..(व्यवधान)..**

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, I may not be available tomorrow. *...(Interruptions)...* Sir, I may not be available tomorrow. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; this protest will go. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI YASWANT SINHA: I find a very obscurantist attitude which is being demonstrated here by certain sections of the House. The consensus in this House is being violated. It is being destroyed. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: There is no consensus on this issue. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, what this? ...(Interruptions)... Who is destroying the decorum of the House? *...(Interruptions)...* They are destroying the convention of the House. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI EKANATH K. THAKUR: Sir, we want to seek your protection. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am seeking your co-operation and you are seeking my co-operation. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, can I say one thing? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI EKANATH K. THAKUR: Sir, the hon. Defence Minister has said that he is at the disposal of the House. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Ministers are always at the disposal of the House. *...(Interruptions)...* It is not that they are not at the disposal of the House. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : सर, मिनिस्टर साहब यहां है, फिर आप पूछने क्यों नहीं दे रहे है? **...(व्यवधान) ...**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If we do this, then we will set a wrong convention, Madam. *...(Interruptions)...* खत्म करने का सवाल नहीं है। हम रॉग कन्वेंशन नहीं डालेंगे। हम कल कोई भी काम नहीं कर सकते। **..(व्यवधान)..**

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : इस हाउस के सबसे सीनियर मैम्बर बैठे है। मैं भी इस सदन का पहले मैम्बर रहा हूं। मैं आप से कह सकता हूं कि any number of occasions ऐसे हुए है, जहां वहां का कंसेंसस यहां नहीं चला है। **...(व्यवधान)..**

श्री उपसभापति : क्या वह हर वक्त होना जरूरी है? **...(व्यवधान)..**

श्री यशंवत सिन्हा : तो यह जो कंसेंसस है, वह ऐसा है जिसके ऊपर जो वहां फैसला हो गया, उसको यहां नहीं चलना चाहिए। **..(व्यवधान)...** ऐसा हुआ ही नहीं है। **..(व्यवधान)...** Any number of times, it has happened. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have said, you should respect *...(Interruptions)...* Please *...(Interruptions)...*

† श्री सैफुद्दीन सौज : मैडम आपका कैसे विश्वास करें। **...(व्यवधान)...**

پیروفیسر سیف الدین سوز: میڈم اپ کا کیسے وثواس کریں.....مداخلت.....

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : विश्वास नहीं करो तो न सही, ऐसे हाउस तो नहीं चलेगा। **...(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, in protest, they can walk out. *...(Interruptions)...* This is too much *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have to speak, Mr. Manoj Bhattacharya. *...(Interruptions)...* मैंने आपको बोला है। आप बोलिए। *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, I am not able to speak. *...(Interruptions)...* They are not allowing me to speak. *...(Interruptions)...*This is too much *...(Interruptions)...* It is too much ... *(Interruptions)...* I have to speak on the functioning of the Ministry of Water Resources. *...(Interruptions)...* What is this? It is too much. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री उपसभापति :मुझे मालूम है रिप्लाई हो जाता था **...(व्यवधान)...** The House is divided. *...(Intenvptions)...* The House is divided. *...(Interruptions)...* I will not be able *...(Interruptions)...* The House is divided *...(Interruptions)...* आप बताइए **...(व्यवधान)...** आप बैठिए **...(व्यवधान)...** यह हाउस का कंसेन्सस में जाइए...(व्यवधान)... हाउस का कंसेन्सस...(व्यवधान)... आप जाइए **...(व्यवधान)...** हाउस का कंसेन्सस **...(व्यवधान)..** आप जाइए **...(व्यवधान)...**

†Transliteration of Urdu Script.

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, this is too much....*(Interruptions)*....Kindly allow me to speak.

श्री मूल चन्द मीणा :उपसभापति जी, यह व्यवस्था **..(व्यवधान)..**

PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ: Sir, we want the discussion on water resources to take place...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, I seek your protection... *(Interruptions)*.... I wish to speak... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री उपसभापति : आप कनक्लूड कीजिए **....(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, what is this*?...(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir kindly allow me to speak *...(Interruptions)*...

PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ: Sir, kindly permit him to speak...*(Interruptions)* don't pick up the issue...*(Interruptions)*...

एक माननीय सदस्य :मंत्री तैयार है **...(व्यवधान)...**

श्री उपसभापति : मंत्री तैयार है , आप भी तैयार है**...(व्यवधान)...**Mr. Narayanasamy, it is not between you...*(Interruptions)*... देखिए, अगर आप क्लैरिफिकेशंन सीक करें तो the entire House has the right to seek a clarfication. They are insisting that it should not be today..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, this is a serious situation.. .*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: We wanted to..*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :सर, पूछने दीजिए **...(व्यवधान)..**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The only reason why I am not allowing *...(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, there has been an occasion in this House in the last session when the Prime Minister made a statement and I was the only member to seek a clarification...*(Interruptions)*...

एक माननीय सदस्य : जब तक **...(व्यवधान)..** करेंगे **...(व्यवधान)..**

श्री उपसभापति :मैं नहीं दूंगा **...(व्यवधान)...** That is why I said that I shall seek the consensus *...(Interruptions)*...You may please go back and sit *...(Interruptions)*...

आप तो तैयार है ...(**व्यवधान**) ...मैंने कब कहा कि तैयार नहीं है ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Who would decide the proceedings of the House...*(Interruptions)...* otherwise, they don't *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You cannot get away with...*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, I seek you protection*...(Interruptions)...*They should go back to their seats.. *.(Interruptions)...*

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : सारे लोग नहीं पूछ रहे है ...(**व्यवधान**)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The debate has to be concluded today. If you are not able to speak, we shall conclude the debate and *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, how could that *be...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, please, allow him to speak *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री उपसभापति : डिबेट कनक्लूड हो जाए, उसके बाद पूछ लेना ...(**व्यवधान**)..

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: What is this, *Sir...(Interruptions)...I* have been patiently waiting to speak on the subject of water resources...*(Interruptions)...*1 must speak, Sir..*(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : बीच में क्यों बुलवाया ....(**व्यवधान**)...

PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ: Sir, this is not done...*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: You cannot run the House like this... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, this is too much...*(Interruptions)...*This is unnecessary interruption...*(Interruptions)...*I wish to speak...*(Interruptions)...*

PROF. SAIF-UD-DIN SOZ: We want discussions on water resources. That is the business before the House*...(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :बीच में क्यों बुलवाया ....(**व्यवधान**).. बीच में बुलवाया ...(**व्यवधान**)... अब पूछने नहीं देंगे ...(**व्यवधान**)....

PROF. SAIF-UN-DIN SOZ: This is the business before the House.... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: ft cannot be done at your will *...(Interruptions)...*Everybody has to agree to it? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: What is this?...*(Interruptions)...This* is too much, Sir....*(Interruptions)...* I must be allowed to speak... *(Interruptions)...*

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया :बीच मे बोले **…(व्यवधान)…**

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, this is too *much...(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : आपने क्यों बुलवाया बीच में **..(व्यवधान)…**

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, I seek your protection. *...(Interruptions)...* I must be allowed to speak...*(Interruptions)...]* am going to speak today...*(Interruptions)...*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :पूछने दीजिए **..(व्यवधान)..**

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: Sir, they are holding the House for ransom. What is this? ... *(Interruptions).* ..Why should I sit down? This is not fair...*(Interruptions)...*They are holding the House for ransom. What is this. *..(Interruptions)...* Why should I withdraw? This is unfair.. *.(Interruptions)...* I shall speak today. *.(Intenuptions)...* I shall speak today...*(Interruptions)...]* must speak today...*(Interruptions)...]* may not be available tomorrow...*(Interruptions)...*Who can say about tomorrow...(Interruptions)...I will speak today...*(Interruptions)...*Sir, I must be allowed to speak today...*(Interruptions)...*This is too much, Sir.. *(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned to meet tomorrow at 11 a.m.

The House then adjourned at forty-nine minutes
past six of the clock till eleven of the clock
on Thursday, the 21st April, 2005.

MGIPMRND—1162RS—16-08-2005.